

The Pendleton Historic Preservation Commission met on October 09, 2018 at 7:00pm at the Pendleton Town Hall, 100 W State Street, Pendleton, Indiana.

The meeting was called to order at 7:00pm. Board Members present were Randall Woodruff, Bruce Ring, George Harris and Craig Campbell. A quorum was established. Representing the Town were Planning and Zoning Administrator Kayla Hassett and Planning Clerk Kate Edwards.

MINUTES

MOTIONED BY BRUCE RING, SECONDED BY GEORGE HARRIS, APPROVAL OF SEPTEMBER 17, 2018 MEETING MINUTES. MOTION CARRIED.

OLD BUSINESS

- A. Enlargement of Existing/Creation of New Historic District
Hassett reported that more work was done regarding the Historic District Survey and she trialed the survey form on the Opera House, 117 N Pendleton Avenue. The Opera House survey form was presented via Google Drive. Hassett also included a couple of photos taken. She had reviewed the plaque of the house history and she also went inside and found a binder in the lobby upstairs on the history of the property. The entire survey took her twenty minutes. Hassett believes they are on track for the April/May launch. Hassett advised that she contacted Amy Borland, an architectural historian with the DHPA, and asked if she would be willing to hold a training session for the surveyors and was looking forward to her response.

Hassett posted on Google Drive a document on building types. It covers the types, not the styles. The type is more the building form which you can apply difference styles too.

- B. Main Street Revitalization Program (MSRP) Grant Update
Hassett reported two items being added to the order of construction: lamp post speakers, over the next few months, and wayfinding signage which Planning is working on getting the final quote. She also advised that the end of construction has changed from October 31st to November 30th, but still within the original December deadline.

Hassett reviewed the pictures of the five facades within her presentation and answered any questions.

- C. Historic Preservation Fund (HPF) Grant Update
Hassett reported a proposal was received from Ratio Architects on August 27th, the only proposal received, and DHPA has approved their proposal. A rendering was provided on Google Drive. Hassett reported that design services will be

done for the entire exterior of Town Hall so Planning will be ready for another grant when we get funding to do the rest of the building.

D. Cemetery Heritage Sign

Hassett spoke of Bob Post's concerns about the placement of the sign for the old West side cemetery. Decided there was a location more central on a high point so people can see it from all over the old East side cemetery. Historic Fall Creek Pendleton Settlement has not voiced their opinion as yet.

Campbell asked why the Established c. 1834 on one sign is not also included on the other. Hassett reported that first was the old East side. Mr. Samuel Irish buried his wife there in 1834 at least that we can find. That side grew and in 1902 the Town purchased the property on the other side. So they are definitely different histories. Pendleton began controlling the old side back in 1902.

Edwards reported that we are still burying on the old side but only in family plots that have graves open. She went on to report that the records for the entire old East side were destroyed in the Town Hall explosion in the 50s and all we have currently is a hand written grid of stones.

NEW BUSINESS

A. HPC10092018-01 – 110 W High St – Siding

Hassett's Google Drive presentation included the COA submitted by Bob Post, current exterior pictures and aerial picture. This property is owned by Post and was just taken into the Historic District in June 2018, as petitioned by Post. Post was not present at this HPC meeting. This COA is just for siding. The changes reflected in the pictures were done when the property prior to when it was taken into the Historic District, otherwise the whole façade would be here today for your approval. Post is requesting COA for cement fiber board siding over the black tar paper area, which he will match to the reveal of the existing vinyl siding and paint it to match.

This structure was built in 1980. Mr Post's plan is to put commercial space in the first floor and residential in the second. Since non-contributing when it came into the Historic District, and will remain so due to its age, we should be pairing it against Planned Business Design Guidelines. Fiber Cement board has been accepted, even though it is not included in the Design Guidelines. Ring added that Indiana Landmarks accepts it. This product was not around when the Design Guidelines were written.

Woodruff asked what the alternative would be. Hassett said Post would have to come back to the HPC either way because it isn't finished.

Ring said it was like this when Post applied to be in the Historic District and, at that time, there were no regulations on what could or couldn't happen there. Adding, unfortunately that is exactly what we have been talking about in trying to extend the Preservation District.

Woodruff asked if the HPC controls what is in the Planned Business Guidelines. Hassett reported it was the Plan Commission. Woodruff asked why they have not updated the Planned Business Guidelines. Hassett advised it is on the list but it isn't as urgent as our Historic Preservation District Guidelines. Hassett said we have discussed how having any building in the Historic District refer to the Planned Business Guidelines, basically strip mall architecture, isn't appropriate even if the building isn't historic. That is why we are changing our guidelines.

Woodruff read that the Staff Recommendation was to Approve. Hassett said, yes, since there was nothing there currently and she could foresee him eventually replacing all of the siding since the current siding is in bad condition.

CRAIG CAMPBELL MOTIONED, SECONDED BY GEORGE HARRIS, TO APPROVE HPC10092018-01.

CLERK TOOK ROLE FOR THE VOTE. GEORGE HARRIS YAY. RANDALL WOODRUFF NAY.

Ring voiced concern that there are no stipulations on this. There is no way to make this situation look good unless you are agreeing to do something else at some point. Woodruff said if they had the petitioner here tonight, it might be something that could be resolved, but no one is here on behalf of the applicant. Ring asked if he votes NAY, Bob would have to come back in and revisit this. Hassett said yes and if we don't do anything it gets approved automatically. Ring added then that it could stay just as it is forever. Hassett added that regular maintenance would never require him to come in front of the HPC, if he could find matching vinyl siding. It is up to the HPC to Approve or Deny.

CLERK CONTINUED TO TAKE ROLE FOR THE BALANCE OF THE VOTE. BRUCE RING NAY. CRAIG CAMPBELL YAY.

The HPC members applauded Bob Post for his contributions and commitment to Pendleton. Woodruff stated that his Nay vote is largely directed to the Plan Commission and their guidelines, not Mr. Post.

B. HPC10092018-02 – 130 W State St – Burmeister - Awning

Hassett's Google Drive presentation included the COA submitted by applicant Moody Nolan and Anjanette Sivilich for Owner Jerry Burmeister. One option or alternate on the original plan, that was not presented originally, was to have an

awning. It is not very obvious on the plans, so Hassett wanted to review it with the HPC so they won't be surprised. The HPC members all went to the center table to review the blue prints for the awning.

Hassett advised, historically, there was an awning in the early 1900s. A fixed metal awning that came over the entire sidewalk. Not your traditional historic awning.

The posts are going to be metal, probably black, to replicate cast iron posts. The awning itself is going to be metal, probably corrugated, but not 1950s corrugated.

After much discussion over the blue prints, Ring voiced a concern about the 2x6 treated board and it is not wrapped so it is exposed and that's not going to be a good look. And you won't see the corrugated on the underneath side. Ring and others said it needs to be all metal. Hassett called Anjanette to review and placed her on speaker phone. She confirmed that it was all treated material visibly exposed when you look up. Ring asked her if we could do all metal and her reply was they could look at potentially doing all metal. Ring shared that the HPC felt the metal would look much better. Anjanette said they went with the wood option because it was more economic. Ring said the HPC would like to look at a metal option and see if it is feasible. Woodruff explained that these are things that the HPC is considering tonight. Before them was her proposal for evaluation and the HPC was discussing their concerns and discussing any changes. He thanked her for being available.

Woodruff commented that tonight's business points out the need to always have a proponent present because we can't really negotiate, we can only address what has been proposed and we can either approve it or deny it. He went on to explain that it puts Planning staff in a bad position and it puts the HPC in a bad position and, in his view, is somewhat disrespectful to the commission to want to have a COA but not be present to defend it, which is the proponents job.

ROBERT WOODRUFF MOTIONED THAT, IF NOT CONTRARY TO EXISTING RULES, ANY REQUEST FOR A COA OR OTHER POSITIVE ACTION ON BEHALF OF THE COMMISSION BE SUPPORTED BY THE APPLICANT AT THE COMMISSION MEETING. GEORGE HARRIS SECONDED. MOTION CARRIED.

Campbell ask if Burmeister was a historic building. Hassett said it was and that SHIPO had already approved this change, which doesn't mean the HPC can't deny it. Campbell asked why under Staff Findings it is listed as non-historic. Hassett said in our Historic District it is noted as non-historic, but it is going to be contributing. She went on to advise that most of the north side of State Street is listed as non-contributing. Anything that was stucco covered is non-contributing.

Harris shared that the treated materials was a cost cutting measure and can't see

why we couldn't look at an alternative in metal, say extruded aluminum. Ring shared that there are all kinds of options. Harris asked if they could do something that would eliminate the posts and cut that cost. Ring said they could do turn buckles and they wouldn't need the posts at all and wouldn't impede pedestrians, but that would not be a cost saving measure.

CRAIG CAMPBELL MOTIONED, SECONDED BY BRUCE RING, TO DENY HPC10092018-02. MOTION CARRIED.

Hassett then asked Woodruff, regarding the first petition and the tie vote, if there needed to be another vote. Woodruff asked the commission if there was a motion now before the board to deny the request for COA HPC10092018-01.

CRAIG CAMPBELL MOTIONED, SECONDED BY BRUCE RING, TO DENY HPC10092018-01. MOTION CARRIED.

Harris clarified that Mr. Post can now reapply and that was confirmed.

ADJOURNMENT

Next meeting is scheduled for November 13, 2018 at 7pm.

Meeting adjourned at 8:04pm

Kate Edwards
Planning Staff, Town of Pendleton