

# Historic Preservation Commission

MEETING DATE: Tuesday, December 13, 2022

MEETING TIME: 6:00 p.m.

LOCATION: Pendleton Town Hall  
100 W. State Street  
Pendleton, Indiana

## ORDER OF BUSINESS

### I. CALL TO ORDER

Meeting was called to order by George Harris at 6:01 p.m.

### II. ROLL CALL AND DETERMINATION OF QUORUM

Board members in attendance were George Harris, Tammy Bowman, Sandi Butler, Craig Campbell, Ted Julian and Bob Post. A quorum was established. Individuals representing the Town in person were Planning Director Hannahrose Urbanski; attending via Zoom Town Attorney Jeff Graham. Jon Oliver of Grow Properties, Chad Lukens of 4250 S 350 E, Middletown, Indiana and John Buermann of Westlund Concepts. Also attending via Zoom: Steve and Melissa Denny and Marissa Skaggs.

### III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

Meeting Minutes for 10/11/22 and 10/31/22 tabled by President George Harris to the next meeting.

- There was discussion regarding the October 31, 2022 Special Meeting Minutes and adding more specific language, reflecting the Town's financial responsibility if the owner incurs additional expenses due HPC's changes after approval of the application.

**Motion requested by George Harris to amend the October 31, 2022 Special Meeting Minutes to reflect specific language discussed. Motion made by Sandi Butler, seconded by Craig Campbell; all members present voted in favor of said motion; motion carried.**

**Motion requested by George Harris to approve past Meeting Minutes from 10/11/2022, 10/31/22 and 11/8/22 as amended. Motion made by Craig Campbell, seconded by Sandi Butler; all members present voted in favor of said motion; motion carried.**

### IV. OLD BUSINESS

- A. HPC11082022-01: COA for AMOCO gas station signage, 121 E State St. Westlund Concepts.

Hannah Urbanski presented:

- Signage for gas canopy, sign for building, gas price sign. All Internally illuminated. All fit size requirements and type requirement for DB per UDO. (Application in Google Drive)
- 3 signs on gas canopy, 1 sign on building, new gas price sign
- The new gas price sign is technically a post sign, but will be wrapped to look like a monument sign, and landscaping will be added within the sign due to the ground limitations. This will replace the current tall gas price sign.

Hannah Urbanski presented the Staff Analysis, which is to analyze the petition against the Historic Preservation Guidelines, Unified Development Ordinance and other approved Certificates of Appropriateness. Based on that Urbanski stated:

- The proposed signage fits size and type requirements for DB zoning per the UDO
- Gas stations typically have illuminated signage, but it should be taken under consideration for the Historic District
- The signage install does not pose a threat to public health and safety

**Motion requested by George Harris to accept HPC11082022-01: COA for AMOCO gas station signage. Motion made by Craig Campbell, seconded by Sandi Butler; all members present voted in favor of said motion; motion carried.**

V. New BUSINESS

- A. HPC12132022-01-01: COA for full façade rehab and signage. 105 E State St. The Stable. Melissa Denny

Hannahrose Urbanski presented:

- Currently restaurant / bar with outdoor seating.
- Sanborn maps from 1914 show The Stable as an auto sales room, abutting an auto repair shop (old dry cleaner/glass shop); old undated photo shows it as Specks Restaurant. (Application and photos in Google Drive)
- The Applicant is looking to do a full façade rehab, complete with: brick, faux arch windows on 2<sup>nd</sup> story, new door, garage door style windows/sliding doors on either side of the front door, awning and new signage and lighting. Example images provided (available on Google Drive)

Questions and discussion, Melissa and Steve Denny provided information:

- The brick under the arches would be the same brick, but in a different direction.
- Steve reminded that The Stable has been in town since 2010 and in current location since 2014. This rehab is a total commitment to the Town, in addition to the façade rehab, a complete indoor remodel will be done as well.

Hannah Urbanski presented the Staff Analysis, which is to analyze the petition against the Historic Preservation Guidelines, Urbanski stated

- Rehab utilizes appropriate materials for Downtown historic facades.

- 1914 auto related use speaks to the use of the sliding garage doors similar to Sophies Bagels.
- If front door transoms can be saved and utilized, they appear to be original/historic per the photo of Specks Restaurant, and could be used in conjunction with a garage style door.
- Facade rehab does not pose a threat to public health and safety
- Bob Post questioned the accuracy of the Sanborn map, discussion regarding the pertinence to The Stable. Urbanski assured details in questions, i.e. the railroad is present; the image in the presentation is cropped very closely for the detail of the buildings.
- Question raised about precedent of historical wood buildings being converted to brick. Sandi Butler confirmed if originally wood, it does not get covered with brick. In addition, the transom windows are still intact, so those would need to be preserved. Even though the garage style window design is appealing, the remodel design should keep it original. Discussion about historic preservation versus progress, as the proposed design is very attractive. Does the building need to look like it originally was, or can it look historically accurate? Butler reiterated if the original windows are already there and useable, they should not be removed or they should be replaced with the same type of window.
- Melissa Denny asked why the windows need to stay the same. Butler informed it is because the Town is on the National Register of Historic Places.
- Petitioners expressed concern over the age of the building and the need to improve and modernize. Butler confirmed that old buildings can be remodeled to historical standards.
- Can the transom windows stay in tact with the garage-style windows below? Contractor Chad Lukens indicated there could be modifications that would potentially upgrade the building and also maintain historical aspects. Butler confirmed this building is contributing to the National Register, so improvements can be made but the facade should not be altered. The transom windows and wood siding need to stay, and the proposed brick color is not historic.
- Steve Denny expressed dismay over not being able to replace wood with brick for aesthetics and maintenance. He is willing to compromise the garage door windows with smaller windows that can go up and down. Tammy Bowman added that preservation is to retain original fabric of a building, and referenced the guidelines for preservation. It is not a matter of personal preference or an issue of what is the most efficient material.
- Urbanski expressed there is potential for window and exterior upgrades, and still maintaining proper preservation. More discussion followed from Board and Petitioners regarding the benefit of an upgrade to this building, the importance of maintaining preservation standards, and potential compromises that work for everyone.
- Bowman requested this to be continued, with changes that reflect the preservation guidelines as referenced in the provided packet.
- Urbanski stated if Petitioner is ready with new designs prior to regularly scheduled HPC meeting, a Special Meeting can be schedule to expedite the process and shorten the downtime for the current business.

**Motion requested by George Harris to continue HPC12132022-01-01: COA for full façade rehab and signage. 105 E State St. The Stable. Motion made by Craig Campbell, seconded by Sandi Butler; all members present voted in favor of said motion; motion carried.**

B. HPC12132022-02: COA for exterior rehab. 107 E State Street. Grow Properties.

Hannahrose Urbanski presented existing conditions:

- Original Haydens Grocery store sign intact on front and side of building.
- E-Z Bake Flour sign on the side of the building is mostly non-existent, due to the wide/ modern windows installed later in the century.
- Original front window frames are still existing for storefront glass (Application and photos available on Google Drive)

Building Owner would like to do the following with COA request:

- Remove lower portion of east facade (below cream bandboard) to allow for new footer and exterior wall.
- New window/doors on front and east side and new east side bandboard installs.
- Repair wood siding.
- Square off roof line with as much as possible salvageable wood from lower portion removal.
- Retain/Repair original mural signage.

The following discussions/comments were made:

- Urbanski indicated that possibly with Board funds the sign could be remove/repared and placed inside or elsewhere in Town.
- The outside of the building would remain wood.
- Questions regarding the reasoning to flatten out the roofline. Adjacent building has flat roof. Historical photo shows slanted roof. Board agrees with squaring up the roofline.
- The original door does not appear to be recessed, based on photos.
- There is uncertainty about the transoms on the front, as to their originality.
- The building is on the National Register.
- When not able to salvage material, Owner would use like material or similar material.
- Approximately 1970's when building modifications were made; mansard roof, inaccurate doors and windows.

Staff analysis:

- Rehab utilizes original materials and window/door styles and greatly opens the "dead" side of the building for better engagement.
- Lower portion of east side of building has been compromised over the years of window/door installs that were inappropriate.
- Front facade rehab is accurate to historic/original building look.

- Facade rehab does not pose a threat to public health and safety.

**Motion to accept COA HPC12132022-02 as written as requested. Motion made by Craig Campbell, seconded by Tammy Bowman; all members present voted in favor of said motion; motion carried.**

C. HPC12132022-03: COA for awning. 108-110 N Pendleton Ave. Grow Properties.

Hannahrose Urbanski presented the following:

- Building owner would like to install awnings over two front doors. (Application and photos available on Google Drive)
- Standard anchored metal awnings approximately 14 ft each.
- Concern that the photos provided show modern-looking awnings and anchors. Urbanski to address that with Owner.

**Motion to continue COA HPC12132022-03 until next meeting. Motion made by Craig Campbell, seconded by Sandi Butler; all members present voted in favor of said motion; motion carried.**

C. Staff Approved COA's since last meeting:

- 111 N Pendleton, JoAnn Owens. Temporary COA for window replacement on second story.
- 118 N. Pendleton Avenue, Kirstin Phillips, Invited Brunch and Blessings. COA for sign permit.

## VI. ADJOURNMENT

**Motion to adjourn requested by George Harris. Motion made by Sandi Butler, seconded by Craig Campbell; all members present voted in favor of said motion. Meeting adjourned to at 7:09 pm.**

Next meeting Tuesday, January 10, 2022 at 6:00 pm